



**DUBLIN**  
CALIFORNIA

**Community  
Task Force on  
Equity,  
Diversity,  
and Inclusion  
Report**

July 2021



# TABLE OF CONTENTS

1. Acknowledgments .....	1
2. Preamble .....	2
3. Executive Summary.....	4
4. Background.....	5
5. Task Force Meeting Overview .....	7
6. Final Recommendations—Policing.....	8
<i>Training Curriculum</i> .....	10
<i>Policies and Procedures</i> .....	11
<i>Data Transparency and Context</i> .....	15
<i>Communications</i> .....	17
<i>Public Engagement and Community Relations</i> .....	17
<i>Additional Recommendations</i> .....	18
7. Final Recommendations—Citywide DEI Initiatives.....	19
<i>Boards and Commission Recruitment</i> .....	21
<i>Inclusive, Equitable and Accessible Programming and Events</i> .....	24
<i>Community Agency Funding and Support</i> .....	27
<i>Communications</i> .....	30
<i>Other</i> .....	31
8. Conclusion .....	33
9. Appendix .....	34
<i>Appendix A: City of Dublin Mission and Vision Statements</i> .....	34

# 1. ACKNOWLEDGMENTS



The Community Task Force on Equity, Diversity and Inclusion (Task Force) is honored to present this Report to the Dublin City Council. For over 6 months, the Task Force has been dedicated to discussing recommendations on policing and citywide Diversity, Equity and Inclusion (DEI) policies and practices, and is appreciative that the City Council has given the Task Force members the platform to do so by approving the creation of this body.

The Task Force additionally extends its immense gratitude to Linda Smith, John Stefanski, and Cierra Fabrigas at the City Manager's Office, Jordyn Bishop at the City Attorney's Office, Chief Garrett Holmes at Dublin Police Services and Paul C. Hudson and Rodas Hailu at Seed Collaborative for their insight, guidance, and assistance during this process. Furthermore, the Task Force would like to acknowledge the public comments and recommendations received from the Dublin Inclusion Project, and the many community members, organizations, cultural groups, and student organizations who fought for the Task Force to be created.

Finally, the Task Force wants to express its sincere thanks and gratitude for the generous support of family and friends, without which the Task Force would have been unable to complete its mission.





Since the beginning of 2021, the Task Force has been diligently committed to discussing and developing recommendations that will help shape the City of Dublin (Dublin or City) to become a more safe, equitable and inclusive City for all. Following the City Council's directed scope, the Task Force has strategized on policing and citywide DEI recommendations that would reflect the values of the City.

As Dublin grows and becomes increasingly more diverse, the Task Force believes that current policies and structures, both within Dublin Police Services and City operations, must be further improved to recognize, promote, and sustain diversity, equity, and inclusion. The recommendations in this Report work to address these challenges and push the City in a direction that wholly embodies its Mission Statement:

---

**A Dublin that “promotes and supports a high quality of life, ensures a safe and secure environment, fosters new opportunities, provides equity across all programs, and champions a culture of diversity and inclusion.”<sup>1</sup>**

---

As the recommendations strive to bring about inclusion and belonging for all members of the Dublin community, and to help the City make policy choices that center and prioritize equity, the Task Force asks that the City Council keep this Mission front and center as they review the Report.

Through their extensive due diligence process, the Task Force discovered opportunities for change and adaptation, and areas of limitation. As it pertains to policing, the Task Force believes that Dublin's policing contract with the Alameda County Sheriff's Office (ACSO) is restricting and challenging to navigate. The contract was perhaps the most significant hurdle in drafting recommendations; it limited the Task Force's ability to make proposals that would address their policing concerns directly in the City, whereas the contract requires input and approval first from the Sheriff's office. Furthermore, the Task Force noticed that there were limitations on available data, such as de-escalation and metrics on preventative measures utilized by police, due to there not being suitable techniques widely in place to collect and report this information. The Task Force also encountered a similar issue when discussing recommendations on

<sup>1</sup> See Appendix A (pg. 34) to view the City of Dublin's Mission and Vision statements



citywide DEI, including a lack of racial data of staff from organizations requesting funding, as these statistics are not currently being documented. Ultimately, the Task Force drafted recommendations with these barriers and considerations in mind.

Some of the recommendations in the Report fall outside of the City Council's identified scope for the Task Force. Through discussions at meetings amongst members, as well as suggestions and input from the public, including the Dublin Inclusion Project, the Task Force has included proposals that fall outside the original scope, such as providing ongoing DEI training for all City staff, and considering potentially ceasing to contract with ACSO and instead exploring alternative approaches to public safety. As the Task Force prioritizes equity and belonging, these additional proposals help center other topics of concern for the City's attention.

The Task Force believes that the recommendations in this Report will help place the City on a different trajectory towards prioritizing diversity, equity and inclusion that will create a more inclusive community for all to live and thrive. These recommendations are the first step in this bridging—an opportunity “to connect and explicitly work with other groups and seek ways to build common ground”—and the Task Force hopes that they prompt conversations and action from the City and community.<sup>2</sup>

This Report reflects the Task Force's commitment to the City Council's assigned scope, and to the wellbeing of all Dublin residents. The Task Force committed many volunteer hours throughout the engagement to understand City operations and identify avenues to advance belonging and inclusion within the Dublin community. The Task Force is honored to have been selected for this opportunity and is eager to see these recommendations be approved and implemented to create a flourishing and safer community for all.



---

<sup>2</sup> <https://belonging.berkeley.edu/bridgingandbreaking>

## 3. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY



This Report provides a number of recommendations and strategies developed by the Task Force regarding City Council-designated focus areas of policing and citywide diversity, equity and inclusion initiatives. A summary of key Task Force findings and recommendations are provided below.

### POLICING

- **Accountability:** A critical structure to police accountability is the formation of a Dublin Police Advisory Commission to monitor implementation of approved recommendations, advocate for greater transparency, evaluate data, and receive public input and comment.
- **Alternatives to Police:** Key to smart policing is creation of multidisciplinary mobile crisis teams to respond and address non-violent situations and connect individuals experiencing mental health disorders to supportive services.
- **Transparency:** Reliable and comprehensive data is critical to developing solutions to reduce biases, improve policies and enhance community police relations.
- **Hiring:** Community/police relations and understanding, reduction in violent responses, and police reform are enhanced by hiring police officers that reflect the diversity of the City.

### CITYWIDE DEI INITIATIVES

- **Equity:** The City must develop processes and policies that make City programs, events, and resources more accessible and facilitate more diversity of thought, culture, perspective, and that create a City where everyone belongs.
- **Data:** The City should identify various touch points/opportunities to obtain demographic data from Dublin residents. Data informs strategies and supports accountability.
- **Diversity:** The City needs to continue to identify opportunities and develop tools and strategies to make participation on commissions, boards and task forces, and involvement with programs and events more diverse to reflect the many cultures, ethnicities and backgrounds present in Dublin.

The key findings and recommendations are further expanded, explained, and detailed in the Task Force's final recommendations included in sections 6 and 7 below.

## 4. BACKGROUND



During a July 9, 2020 special meeting, the City Council conducted a study session to discuss policing and services in the City. Prompted by the national conversation around police brutality, the study session provided a forum to discuss the various public comments requesting a review of policing policies and procedures within Dublin. The City Council discussion resulted in the formation of an Ad-Hoc Committee, consisting of Councilmembers Josey and Kumagai, to explore and develop the scope and mechanics for a Community Task Force on Equity, Diversity and Inclusion.

At its September 1, 2020, meeting, the City Council approved the formation of the Task Force based on recommendations from the Ad-Hoc Committee that included an inclusive process for selecting members to the Task Force. The City Council agreed that the Task Force should represent the demographic diversity of Dublin (i.e., gender, race, age, sexual orientation, etc.) and include homeowners, renters, business owners, property managers, students, and seniors.

The City received 70 applications to serve on the Task Force. The Ad-Hoc Committee reviewed the applications and interviewed 28 applicants via Zoom. Following interviews of the applicants, the Ad-Hoc Committee prepared a list of finalists for review by the Mayor. The Mayor reviewed the list of finalists and concurred with the Ad-Hoc Committee's recommendations.

On November 17, 2020, the City Council approved the Staff recommendation to appoint nine members and three alternates to a Community Task Force on Equity, Diversity and Inclusion, as recommended by the Mayor. The individuals appointed to the Task Force include:

### MEMBERS

Matthew Aini	Isabella Helene David
Kathy Avanzino	Rameet Kohli
Beatriz Ballesteros-Kogan	Eman Tai
Clifford Brown, Jr.	Natasha Tripplett
Martha Orozco	Dyrell Foster <sup>3</sup>

### ALTERNATE

Brittany Jacobs



<sup>3</sup> Mr. Foster initially participated in the Task Force, but was unable to complete the term of his appointment.



The City Council directed the Task Force to review policing and select City activities through a DEI lens and framework. The Task Force was charged with developing recommendations on the following scope:

### POLICING

- a. Training Curriculum
- b. Policies and Procedures
- c. Data Transparency and Context
- d. Communications
- e. Public Engagement and Community Relations

### CITYWIDE DEI INITIATIVES

- a. Boards and Commission Recruitment
- b. Inclusive, Equitable, and Accessible Programming and Events
- c. Community Agency Funding and Support
- d. Communications

The Task Force met from January to June 2021 to draft these recommendations and come to consensus as a group to finalize their most salient proposals. The recommendations listed in this Report are suggested ways the Task Force believes the City can promote and enhance belonging within Dublin through an addition, refinement, and adjustment of current policing and citywide policies and procedures.





## 5. TASK FORCE MEETING OVERVIEW



The Task Force met, with a few exceptions, on a bi-weekly basis during the evenings from January to June 2021.<sup>4</sup> Listed below are the recommendations agreed upon by the Task Force over the course of their 6-month process. All recommendations were first developed in topic-specific, ad-hoc groups and were then presented to the full Task Force for review, comment, and approval.

The Ad Hoc Groups were organized around the following topic areas for each section of work and consisted of the following Task Force members:

### Ad Hoc Group 1

**Policing:** Staff, Management, and Accountability

**Citywide DEI:** Boards & Commission Recruitment/Communications

**Members:** Avanzino, Brown, Kohli

### Ad Hoc Group 2

**Policing:** Mental Health, Training, and Budget

**Citywide DEI:** Events and Programming/Communications

**Members:** Ballesteros-Kogan, David, Tripplett, Foster<sup>5</sup>

### Ad Hoc Group 3

**Policing:** Policies and Procedures

**Citywide DEI:** Community Agency Support/Communications

**Members:** Aini, Jacobs (Alt.), Orozco, Tai

All recommendations were approved by the Task Force unanimously through a consensus-decision making process. Over the course of this engagement, the Task Force was assisted by the City Manager's Office, Dublin Police Services, the City Attorney's Office, and a team of consultants from Seed Collaborative, LLC (Seed).

<sup>4</sup> This timeline does not include the Task Force Orientation, which was conducted in December 2020

<sup>5</sup> Mr. Foster participated in the drafting of policing recommendations with his ad hoc group, but was unable to proceed with the completion of his membership in the Task Force.

## 6. FINAL RECOMMENDATION—POLICING



From January to March 2021, the Task Force prioritized the development of policing recommendations. The group began their initial meetings in conversation with Dublin Chief of Police Garrett Holmes. Chief Holmes responded to the Task Force’s questions, presented data and information on Dublin Police Services (DPS), and provided documents and resources.

At the conclusion of exploratory discussions with Chief Holmes, the Task Force agreed to create ad-hoc working groups to divide up the scope of the work and drafting of recommendations. Below are the Task Force policing recommendations grouped according to the parameters set by the City Council.

Ref. #	Recommendation
<b>TRAINING CURRICULUM (TC)</b>	
<b>TC-1</b>	<p><b>Training:</b> DPS should identify ways to expand training offerings for officers, either through muster room briefings, independent study/self-paced trainings, additional training days or other appropriate methods of training.</p> <p>These mandatory trainings should cover (1) Implicit bias, (2) Understanding languages and cultural responsiveness, (3) Understanding people with disabilities, (4) Community policing, (5) Use of Force/De-escalation, (6) Leadership, professionalism, and ethics.</p>
<b>POLICIES AND PROCEDURES (P)</b>	
<b>P-1</b>	<p><b>Accountability:</b> The City Council should create a Police Advisory Commission. This Commission would support the City in monitoring the implementation of the Task Force’s Recommendations, as well as play an ongoing role in advising the City on ways to enhance police-community relations in Dublin.<sup>6</sup></p> <p>The Commission should host a facilitated, recurring community educational workshop on 21st century policy and community relations best practices.</p>
<b>P-2</b>	<p><b>Accountability:</b> The City should advocate for the creation of an Alameda County Sheriff Oversight Board and Inspector General and that Dublin to have a permanent seat on the Board. Additionally, the City should create a Liaison Committee between the City Council and the Sheriff Oversight Board.</p> <p>The City should also advocate for the Sheriff Oversight Board and Inspector General to study harm reduction and procedural justice frameworks for policing, develop recommendations for the implementation of best practices identified from said study, conduct a public study session to discuss policing best practices, and develop a public report which includes findings, recommendations, and actions for the Sheriff’s Office.</p> <p>In the time leading up to the creation of the Sheriff Oversight Board and Inspector General Position, the City should advocate for ACSO and DPS to study the items included in this recommendation.</p> <p>The City should advocate for the Sheriff Oversight Board and Inspector General to amend the Critical Decision-Making Model (CDM) to include self-evaluation and procedural justice during police response, including the assessment of the proportionalism, accountability, necessity, and ethics of police actions. Prompts pertaining to proportionalism can be added for further consideration in the CDM.</p>

<sup>6</sup> Sample Bylaws and Procedures for Advisory Commission: <https://docs.google.com/document/d/1m1W7E9w2mck0B111KZejmpLeQD.AYWwww6OWPYwK.AeMc/edit>



Ref. #	Recommendation
<b>POLICIES AND PROCEDURES (P)</b>	
P-3	<p><b>Hiring:</b> The City Manager should request that the Police Chief consider the following additional unweighted criteria when hiring law enforcement personnel:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Residents of Dublin.</li> <li>• Race/gender/ethnicity/sexual orientation reflective of the City’s demographics.</li> <li>• Community policing experience.</li> <li>• Experience working in diverse communities and/or on diverse teams.</li> </ul> <p>The City Manager should meet with the Police Chief to review the hiring criteria and DPS demographic data on an annual basis.</p>
P-4	<p><b>Non-Violent Response:</b> The City should implement a multidisciplinary mobile crisis team for non-violent situations. The team should consist of a licensed behavioral health provider, an emergency medical technician, and a social worker, who would be dispatched through 911 calls and would attend to non-violent situations.</p>
P-5	<p><b>Non-Violent Response:</b> The City, in collaboration with ACSO, should implement Co-Responder Teams consisting of one police officer and one Mental Health Professional (licensed LMFT or LCSW) to respond to situations where people are experiencing a severe mental health crisis that could pose a threat to safety.</p>
P-6	<p><b>Ticketing:</b> The City should explore with DPS a policy to provide tickets for minor traffic violations via mail similar to parking or toll violations to reduce police/citizen interactions.</p>
<b>DATA TRANSPARENCY AND CONTEXT (DT)</b>	
DT-1	<p><b>Data Transparency:</b> All Racial and Identity Profiling Act of 2015 (RIPA)-required stop data should be published on the City’s Data Transparency Platform on an annual basis to help establish benchmarks in reducing non-violent police interactions. This will include stop data in the following areas:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Perceived race/ethnicity</li> <li>• Primary basis for the stop</li> <li>• Whether consent was given or if there was probable cause</li> </ul>
DT-2	<p><b>Data Transparency:</b> In instances where there is a DPS officer involved shooting or use of force resulting in great bodily injury or death, DPS will make the AB71 and SB1421 data publicly available on the City’s Data Transparency Platform.</p>
DT-3	<p><b>Data Transparency:</b> The City should publish information regarding DPS complaints and commendations data on the City’s Data Transparency Portal.</p>
DT-4	<p><b>Data Transparency:</b> The City publish the demographic data of DPS officers on an annual basis on the City’s Data Transparency Portal.</p>
DT-5	<p><b>Data Collection:</b> The City and ACSO explore ways to collect and report data regarding de-escalation annually to monitor the effectiveness of current de-escalation practices, as well as identify when new practices may be necessary.</p>



Ref. #	Recommendation
<b>COMMUNICATIONS (C)</b>	
C-1	<b>Press Releases:</b> The City should enact an Administrative Policy which states that the City will issue a press release within 72 hours after every incident involving use of lethal force by DPS.
C-2	<b>Filing Complaints &amp; Commendations:</b> The City should develop cards for DPS to provide information on how to make a complaint or commendation and develop additional methods for residents to file DPS complaints and commendations either through electronic means or voicemail.
<b>PUBLIC RELATIONS AND COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT (PR)</b>	
PR-1	<b>Community Engagement:</b> The City should hire a police/community liaison to enhance collaboration between the Dublin Community, City Council, Staff, Dublin Police Services, and the Alameda County Sheriff’s Office. The liaison would also work with advocacy groups, including but not limited to Las Positas College, NAMI, NAACP, and ACLU.



The following sections provide additional context to the above recommendations. Actual Task Force recommendations shown below are featured in green boxes, followed by additional comment, strategies and information.

## Training Curriculum

### TC-1: TRAINING

DPS should identify ways to expand training offerings for officers, either through muster room briefings, independent study/self-paced trainings, additional training days or other appropriate methods of training.

These mandatory trainings should cover (1) Implicit bias, (2) Understanding languages and cultural responsiveness, (3) Understanding people with disabilities, (4) Community policing, (5) Use of Force/De-escalation, (6) Leadership, professionalism, and ethics.

The Task Force encourages DPS to consider expanding training offerings that provide more comprehensive educational opportunities for officers to improve their interactions with civilians. Through their due diligence work, the Task Force discovered that currently, training hours for officers throughout the country are skewed to focus more heavily on firearms training by “training [officers] how to shoot a gun” rather than “discussing the importance of de-escalation tactics and Crisis Intervention strategies.”<sup>7</sup>

The Task Force recommends that the suggested curriculum topics be included in the officers’ continued training to emphasize de-escalation tactics, address issues of discrimination and bias, enhance cultural awareness, and build greater trust in the Dublin community.

<sup>7</sup> <https://www.policeforum.org/assets/reengineeringtraining1.pdf>, pg. 4



## Policies and Procedures

### P-1: ACCOUNTABILITY

The City Council should create a Police Advisory Commission. This Commission would support the City in monitoring the implementation of the Task Force’s Recommendations, as well as play an ongoing role in advising the City on ways to enhance police-community relations in Dublin.<sup>8</sup>

The Commission should host a facilitated, recurring community educational workshop on 21st century policy and community relations best practices.

The Task Force recommends that City Council establish a permanent Police Advisory Commission (Commission) to monitor implementation of policing reforms and provide ongoing review and attention to law enforcement and community safety in Dublin. The Task Force believes that an oversight body is a beneficial resource for the City and community at large, as it helps create transparency on department policies and procedures, provides an opportunity for community input and comment, and facilitates greater accountability to address police misconduct.<sup>9</sup>

The Task Force is aware of the City’s contractual limitations with ACSO as the City cannot dictate performance requirements for Dublin Police Services, but the Task Force strongly believes an advisory body would be a beneficial addition to address the monitoring of public safety within the community.

The Task Force recommends the following guidelines for establishing the Commission:

The Commission be selected by the City Council using a similar appointment process as that used to select Task Force members.	The Commission be independent of Dublin Police Services and the Alameda County Sheriff’s Office.
The Commission’s responsibility would be to support the City with oversight and monitoring of implementation of approved Task Force recommendations, as well as play an ongoing role to enhance police-community relations in Dublin.	The Commission should consider evaluating a harm reduction and/or procedural justice framework for policing. The Task Force recommends the use of this framework to focus on community experiences with police, not just the final outcomes.
The Commission utilize DPS and other data to set benchmarks in reducing traffic stops, minor crimes and traffic violations, and other minor infractions.	

In addition to monitoring implementation of the policing recommendations as laid out in the Report, the Task Force recommends that the Commission also host regular community education workshops to share best practices on policing. The workshops could cover topics such as community policing, police policies and procedures, and would provide a forum to discuss national trends on policing.

The Task Force recommends that the Commission exist and operate in addition to the Sheriff’s Oversight Board and that the Commission liaison with the Oversight Board.

<sup>8</sup> Sample Bylaws and Procedures for Advisory Commission: <https://docs.google.com/document/d/1mIW7E9w2mck0BII1KZejmpLeQDAYWwww6OWPYwKAeMc/edit>

<sup>9</sup> <https://www.nacole.org/benefits>



### P-2: ACCOUNTABILITY

The City should advocate for the creation of an Alameda County Sheriff Oversight Board and Inspector General and that Dublin to have a permanent seat on the Board. Additionally, the City should create a Liaison Committee between the City Council and the Sheriff Oversight Board.

The City should also advocate for the Sheriff Oversight Board and Inspector General to study harm reduction and procedural justice frameworks for policing, develop recommendations for the implementation of best practices identified from said study, conduct a public study session to discuss policing best practices, and develop a public report which includes findings, recommendations, and actions for the Sheriff's Office. In the time leading up to the creation of the Sheriff Oversight Board and Inspector General Position, the City should advocate for ACSO and DPS to study the items included in this recommendation.

The City should advocate for the Sheriff Oversight Board and Inspector General to amend the Critical Decision-Making Model (CDM) to include self-evaluation and procedural justice during police response, including the assessment of the proportionalism, accountability, necessity, and ethics of police actions. Prompts pertaining to proportionalism can be added for further consideration in the CDM.

The Task Force is aware of the potential creation of a Sheriff Oversight Board (Board) and Inspector General by the Alameda County Board of Supervisors, and recommends that the City support the creation of the Board and Inspector General position and advocate for a permanent seat on the Board for the City of Dublin. The Task Force encourages the City to use their seat on the Board (if approved) to make recommendations on harm reduction and police accountability to the Board.

Creation of the Oversight Board is consistent with the Task Force's belief that there needs to be increased accountability, transparency, and oversight of DPS and ACSO.

### P-3: HIRING

The City Manager should request that the Police Chief consider the following additional criteria when hiring law enforcement personnel:

- Residents of Dublin.
- Race/gender/ethnicity/sexual orientation reflective of the City's demographics.
- Community policing experience.
- Experience working in diverse communities and/or on diverse teams.

The City Manager should meet with the Police Chief to review the hiring criteria and DPS demographic data on an annual basis.

The Task Force recommends that the City Manager encourage the Police Chief to consider incorporating unweighted diversity criteria (i.e., race/ethnicity, gender, sexual orientation, relationship to Dublin community, etc.) in hiring processes. Through due diligence



research, the Task Force has found that hiring officers that better reflect the diversity of the communities they serve produce better community relations and make police agencies “more open to reform, more willing to initiate cultural and systemic changes, and more responsive to the residents they serve.”<sup>10</sup>

Additionally, the Task Force recommends that the City Manager meet at least annually with the Police Chief to review police hiring processes and selections and discuss adjustments to hiring criteria as needed to ensure that Dublin police officers reflect the demographics, Mission and Vision of the City.<sup>11</sup>

### P-4: NON-VIOLENT RESPONSE

The City should implement a multidisciplinary mobile crisis team for non-violent situations. The team should consist of a licensed behavioral health provider, an emergency medical technician, and a social worker, who would be dispatched through 911 calls and would attend to non-violent situations.

The Task Force concurs with trending best practices nationwide towards creation of a multidisciplinary mobile crisis team (without police) to address instances of nonviolent mental health situations. The Task Force has researched numerous programs throughout the state and country that have successfully mirrored this approach, such as CAHOOTS in Eugene, Oregon, and believe that a similar project would be a beneficial resource for maintaining the health of Dublin residents.<sup>12</sup>

The Task Force proposes the following suggested implementation approach<sup>13</sup>:

The team would consist of a licensed behavioral health provider, an Emergency Medical Technician, and a Social Worker.	This team would begin by operating Monday through Sunday 11am to 9pm. The hours could expand as deemed necessary and as funding allows.
The purpose of the mobile crisis would be to assess the situation, provide brief supportive interventions, help stabilize crisis matters and assist in connecting individuals to services as well as resources.	Additionally, the mobile crisis team would be available to provide scenario-based training and consultation to law enforcement, first responders, schools, community providers, families, and other community members.
The team would be dispatched through 911 calls and would attend to non-violent situations such as: individuals undergoing a mental health crisis who do not pose a threat to others, non-criminal homeless activity, community dispute resolutions, youth intervention, and welfare checks.	

The benefits of implementing a multidisciplinary crisis team include providing appropriate support services to those in need, reducing instances of police interactions, and promoting greater trust in the City’s willingness to supply holistic approaches to community care.

<sup>10</sup> <https://www.eeoc.gov/advancing-diversity-law-enforcement>;

<sup>11</sup> Visit Appendix A (pg. 34) to view the City of Dublin’s Mission and Vision statements

<sup>12</sup> <https://dublin.ca.gov/DocumentCenter/View/26095/Mental-Health-Training-and-Budget-Ad-Hoc-Update-1?bidId=>

<sup>13</sup> For more information on how to successfully implement a mobile crisis team: [https://www.trinityservices.org/docs/default-source/public/field-notes\\_mobile-crisis-team\\_508final34.pdf?sfvrsn=236986b\\_2](https://www.trinityservices.org/docs/default-source/public/field-notes_mobile-crisis-team_508final34.pdf?sfvrsn=236986b_2)



### P-5: NON-VIOLENT RESPONSE

The City, in collaboration with ACSO, should implement Co-Responder Teams consisting of one police officer and one Mental Health Professional (licensed LMFT or LCSW) to respond to situations where people are experiencing a severe mental health crisis that could pose a threat to safety.

In instances where a person may be experiencing a severe mental health crisis that could pose a threat to themselves and/or others, the Task Force recommends that the City and ACSO jointly explore implementing co-responder teams within DPS. The teams would consist of one police officer and one licensed mental health professionals.

The suggested components of this co-responder team, as laid out by the Task Force would be the following:<sup>14</sup>

Co-responder team would either be first on the scene as dispatched through 911 or be called in by other first responders after initial assessments indicate a necessity of mental health services where there is a threat to safety.

Co-responder team should drive an unmarked police car and wear civilian clothing to intentionally and proactively diffuse tense situations.

Co-responder team would provide immediate help to individuals experiencing a severe mental health crisis, de-escalate intense situations, provide accurate on-the-scene mental health assessments, if necessary, include family and/or friends in crucial information gathering process, connect individuals to resources, and assist with transportation to care facilities for services needed in 5150 cases.

The Task Force has discovered that this approach has shown to provide increased connections to resources to those in need, reduce repeat encounters with law enforcement, minimize arrests, and reduce use of force.<sup>15</sup>

### P-6: TICKETING

The City should explore with DPS a policy to provide tickets for minor traffic violations via mail similar to parking or toll violations to reduce police/citizen interactions.

The intent of this recommendation is to reduce the number of interactions between police and the community. The Task Force recommends that the City Council direct the Police Advisory Commission to identify ways to reduce the number of interactions between the police and community.

---

**Safety - We are dedicated to excellent public safety resources, including police and fire.<sup>16</sup>**

---

<sup>14</sup> For more information on developing and implementing a co-responder program: [https://csgjusticecenter.org/wp-content/uploads/2021/02/CSGJC\\_Field-Notes\\_Law-Enforcement\\_Co-Responder-Program.pdf](https://csgjusticecenter.org/wp-content/uploads/2021/02/CSGJC_Field-Notes_Law-Enforcement_Co-Responder-Program.pdf)

<sup>15</sup> <https://csgjusticecenter.org/wp-content/uploads/2020/02/Police-Mental-Health-Collaborations-Framework.pdf>

<sup>16</sup> See Appendix A (pg. 34) to view the City of Dublin's Mission and Vision statements





### Data Transparency and Context

#### DT-1: DATA TRANSPARENCY

All Racial and Identity Profiling Act of 2015 (RIPA)-required stop data should be published on the City's Data Transparency Platform on an annual basis to help establish benchmarks in reducing non-violent police interactions. This will include stop data in the following areas:

- Perceived race/ethnicity
- Primary basis for the stop
- Whether consent was given or if there was probable cause

The Task Force recommends that stop data be collected and released, as required by RIPA, to monitor for racial bias in DPS stops and help address criminalization and over-policing for minor crimes/infractions.

There is extensive evidence and research showing that, nationally, police stops occur more frequently for Black and Latino drivers and that suspicion of criminality is informed by racial bias.<sup>17</sup> The Task Force believes that this data collection is a necessary step to inaugurate a system that establishes metrics for future data reporting, create transparency on how policing is conducted in the City, and reduce the number of stops.

#### DT-2: DATA TRANSPARENCY

In instances where there is a DPS officer involved shooting or use of force resulting in great bodily injury or death, DPS will make the AB71 and SB1421 data publicly available on the City's Data Transparency Platform.

The Task Force recommends that the City Manager request DPS to provide comprehensive reporting for incidents involving Use of Force as required by AB 71 and SB 1421. Information in this report should include the following:

- a. The gender, race and age of each individual who was shot, injured, or killed.
- b. The date, time, and location of the incident.
- c. Whether the civilian was armed, and if so, the type of weapon.
- d. The type of force used against the officer, the civilian, or both, including the types of weapons used.
- e. The number of officers involved in the incident.
- f. Number of officers using force in the incident.

<sup>17</sup> <https://sharad.com/papers/100M-stops.pdf>



- g. The number of civilians involved in the incident.
- h. A brief description regarding the circumstances surrounding the incident, which may include the nature of injuries to officers and civilians and perceptions on behavior or mental disorders.

### DT-3: DATA TRANSPARENCY

The City should publish information regarding DPS complaints and commendations data on the City's Data Transparency Portal.

The Task Force recommends that the City advance conversations with ACSO to ensure that filed complaints and/or commendations are accessible through the City's Data Transparency Portal.

The Task Force understands that aggregate complaint data is collected and then reported by ACSO to the California Department of Justice, and that commendation data can be released publicly. The Task Force believes that releasing both data sets annually will provide the community more oversight and transparency on police behavior and misconduct, and guide future policing reforms.

### DT-4: DATA TRANSPARENCY

The City publish the demographic data of DPS officers on an annual basis on the City's Data Transparency Portal.

To create more awareness and reduce ambiguity on the hiring demographics and trends of DPS officers, the Task Force recommends the annual publishing of DPS hiring information on the City's Data Transparency Portal.

### DT-5: DATA COLLECTION

The City and ACSO explore ways to collect and report data regarding de-escalation annually to monitor the effectiveness of current de-escalation practices, as well as identify when new practices may be necessary.

The Task Force is aware that currently, de-escalation data is not collected in a format suitable for analysis and publication. The Task Force believes that the public release of this information can monitor instances of use of force and help measure the success and failures of implementing de-escalation strategies within DPS.

The Task Force recommends that DPS and ACSO collaborate to develop data collection standards and metrics to monitor for de-escalation. This data would help identify potential patterns of individual bias and performance concerns from police officers.



### Communications

#### C-1: PRESS RELEASE

The City should enact an Administrative Policy which states that the City will issue a press release within 72 hours after every incident involving use of lethal force by DPS.

The Task Force recognizes the importance of releasing transparent, accurate and timely reports in policing altercations, particularly those in which lethal force was used. Transparency and timely reporting reinforce community trust and support bridging the divide between community and DPS.

#### C-2: FILING COMPLAINTS AND COMMENDATIONS

The City should develop cards for DPS to provide information on how to make a complaint or commendation, and develop additional methods for residents to file DPS complaints and commendations either through electronic means or voicemail.

The Task Force supports creating and promoting accessible tools and resources that facilitate civilian's ability to make complaints and/or commendations regarding DPS performance. The Task Force recommends that the City collaborate with the Sheriff's Office to provide more comprehensive filing options and methods.<sup>18</sup>

### Public Relations and Community Engagement

#### PR-1: COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT

The City should hire a police/community liaison to enhance collaboration between the Dublin Community, City Council, Staff, Dublin Police Services, and the Alameda County Sheriff's Office. The liaison would also work with advocacy groups, including but not limited to Las Positas College, NAMI, NAACP, and ACLU.

The Task Force recommends that a liaison position be created to facilitate stronger collaboration amongst the various government entities that serve Dublin (i.e., DPS, ACSO, City Council, etc.) and the overall community (including CBOs, nonprofits, advocacy groups, etc.). The liaison would function as a point-person to better assess community needs, create an outlet for residents to share concerns, and strategize ways to improve public safety conditions.

<sup>18</sup> <https://dublin.ca.gov/Faq.aspx?TID=25, #15>



### Additional Recommendations

The following recommendations resulted from public comment and testimony that referenced demands formulated by the Dublin Inclusion Project. Several of the other recommendations presented below are driven by the need for additional information and due diligence to make informed decisions.

#### **School Resource Officers**

The Task Force recommends that the City Council direct the Police Advisory Commission to initiate public hearings, to include the Dublin Unified School District, Dublin Police Services, parents, and community members, to evaluate and discuss the purpose and success of School Resource Officers (SROs) and the appropriate allocation of SROs.

#### **Tobacco Enforcement Grant**

The Task Force recommends that the City of Dublin explore grant opportunities and apply for grant funding from the California Department of Justice (DOJ) Tobacco Grant Program and other funders for non-police community-based organizations to provide services and programs to reduce tobacco use, including retailer training programs, public education outreach, parent engagement and education, or tobacco retail license inspections.

#### **ACSO Contract**

The Task Force recommends that the City Council direct the Police Advisory Commission to conduct a study to evaluate the advantages and disadvantages of the City of Dublin ceasing to contract with the Alameda County Sheriff's Office (ACSO) for police services, establishing an independent Dublin Police Department, or exploring other public safety options.

#### **Sanctuary City Data**

The Task Force recommends that the City request and publish data on ACSO's compliance with GO 1.24, which relates to ASCO's policy to not report immigrants to Immigration and Customs Enforcement (ICE).



## 7. FINAL RECOMMENDATION—CITYWIDE DEI INITIATIVES



In the months of April and May of 2021, the Task Force considered, discussed, and developed recommendations for citywide DEI policies, procedures, and practices based on the scope of work identified by the City Council. Similarly to the process for the Policing scope, the Task Force split into ad-hoc working groups to formulate their recommendations. The agreed-upon Task Force recommendations are provided below.

Ref. #	Recommendation
<b>BOARD AND COMMISSIONS RECRUITMENT (BC)</b>	
BC-1	<b>Recruitment:</b> The City Manager ensure that all Board, Commission, Committee and Task Force (collectively referred to as Commissions or Commission) vacancies are posted on the City’s monthly newsletter, “Backyard Brief”, as well as all other City publications and communication vehicles, and that Council members, City Staff, and commissioners, as well as local nonprofits, faith-based organizations, and DUSD are notified of such vacancies and encouraged to promote participation by City residents.
BC-2	<b>Data:</b> Commission applications request demographic information (e.g., race, gender, age, income level, etc.) as well as include DEI focused questions.
BC-3	<b>Policy:</b> The Mayor utilize a DEI weighted scoring system when evaluating Commission applications (e.g., demographics, underserved communities, etc.) to ensure an inclusive and equitable selection process.
BC-4	<b>Policy:</b> City Council expand membership on all commissions to no less than seven members to allow for more opportunities for residents to serve on commissions.
BC-5	<b>Process:</b> The City Manager review and evaluate the procedures and processes for collection and retention of information regarding commission applicants, as well as Inside Dublin graduates, and determine if the processes and procedures need to be amended to ensure that opportunities to serve on Commissions are being shared with Commission applicants and Inside Dublin graduates.
BC-6	<b>Policy:</b> The City Manager create a formal certification and mentor program that prepares Dublin residents to serve on Commissions.
BC-7	<b>Policy:</b> City Council limit the duration of a term that a commissioner can serve on a Commission to a period of four years. This term limit policy to include the following: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Commissioners would not be allowed to serve successive terms on the same Commission but could reapply for non-successive terms.</li> <li>Commissioners would be allowed to apply to be placed on another commission once their term ends.</li> </ul>
<b>INCLUSIVE EQUITABLE AND ACCESSIBLE PROGRAMMING AND EVENTS (IP)</b>	
IP-1	<b>Events:</b> The City of Dublin host monthly Town Hall meetings designed to amplify the voices and concerns of diverse groups represented in the City of Dublin.



Ref. #	Recommendation
<b>INCLUSIVE EQUITABLE AND ACCESSIBLE PROGRAMMING AND EVENTS (IP)</b>	
IP-2	<b>Data:</b> The City collect data on artists and artistic diversity represented in Dublin and include the data in the annual report.
IP-3	<b>Policy:</b> The City of Dublin translate local government and City information into multiple languages and post paper copies to be displayed at strategic locations and commonly used spaces and venues identified by the City.
IP-4	<b>Events:</b> The Splatter festival be renamed and rebranded to reflect a multicultural festival that highlights the diverse cultures represented in Dublin through entertainment, food, and interactive activities.
IP-5	<b>Events:</b> The City of Dublin to promote local restaurants and small businesses that are owned and operated by under-represented groups through new and existing local events.
IP-6	<b>Art:</b> The City of Dublin displays public art that represents the City’s diversity and utilizes the public art fund in an equitable manner that encourages creation of art that represents diverse perspectives.
IP-7	<b>Programming:</b> The City of Dublin proactively recruit instructors and intentionally seek class offerings that represent the diverse cultures and ethnicities in Dublin.
IP-8	<b>Programming:</b> The City of Dublin enhance efforts to inform Dublin residents how to submit requests for additional classes that are reflective of the City’s diversity.
IP-9	<b>Library:</b> The City of Dublin collaborate with the Alameda County Public Library to increase the selection of books by authors and illustrators who represent the diversity of Dublin (i.e., language, culture, ability, gender, etc.).
<b>COMMUNITY AGENCY FUNDING AND SUPPORT (CF)</b>	
CF-1	<b>Data:</b> The City of Dublin collect demographic and experiential data to identify barriers and challenges to help inform development of an equitable Human Services Grant application and funding process.
CF-2	<b>Application:</b> The City of Dublin amend the Human Services Grant application to gather more demographic data and include DEI considerations.
CF-3	<b>Process:</b> The City Manager ensure equitable procedures and practices in the selection of grantees and the allocation of funding.
<b>COMMUNICATIONS (CO)</b>	
CO-1	<b>Communications:</b> The City Manager establish regular touchpoints and communications with a diverse group of community leaders and local organizations.
CO-2	<b>Communications:</b> The City of Dublin establish additional channels for two-way communication with all City residents.
CO-3	<b>Social Media:</b> The City Manager review social media policies and initiate social media campaigns to boost followers of the City’s official social media accounts, as well as establish criteria and policies for posting content with a DEI lens.



Ref. #	Recommendation
CO-4	<p><b>Social Media:</b> The City engage with the Dublin community to revise the City calendar to include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Lunar New Year: Change wording from “Chinese”.</li> <li>• Remove Cinco De Mayo, and/or use the opportunity to inform about its true history and discourage stereotyping.</li> <li>• Explore adding another holiday that is meaningful to Dublin Latino/a community, e.g., Latin American Independence September 15-16</li> <li>• Larry Itliong Day, October 25</li> </ul>
<b>OTHER (0)</b>	
O-1	<p><b>Data:</b> The City of Dublin collect the following data sets: disaggregated data on specific languages spoken at home, and disaggregated ancestry data on Asian Americans in Dublin.</p>
O-2	<p><b>Training:</b> The City provide ongoing DEI training for all City staff. This should include training specific to work roles (e.g., Communications Manager and Communications Analyst).</p>
O-3	<p><b>DEI:</b> The City Manager embed DEI into the work and culture of the City, to include development of a Dublin City DEI process and decision-making checklist.</p>
O-4	<p><b>Transparency:</b> The City ensure greater transparency regarding grants for which the City applies to allow for community input and comment.</p>
O-5	<p><b>Oversight:</b> The City create a Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion (DEI) Commission to monitor implementation of Task Force recommendations, uplift best practices in DEI, and hold public hearings and receive public comments on equity and belonging in Dublin.</p>



The following section expands on the Citywide DEI recommendations (in bold and italics) by providing additional context and framing.

## Board and Commissions Recruitment

### BC-1: RECRUITMENT

The City Manager ensure that all Board, Commission, Committee and Task Force (collectively referred to as Commissions or Commission) vacancies are posted on the City’s monthly newsletter, “Backyard Brief”, as well as all other City publications and communication vehicles, and that Council members, City Staff, and commissioners, as well as local nonprofits, faith-based organizations, and DUSD are notified of such vacancies and encouraged to promote participation by City residents.

The Task Force believes that a key factor in commission recruitment is sufficient notification of vacancies. This recommendation addresses the ways that the City can expand outreach, awareness, and notice of commission vacancies and opportunities. The Task Force



also recommends that the City conduct intentional outreach to current and past commissioners with the hope that they will share information on commission vacancies and their experiences serving on commissions via their social media accounts. The Task Force's recommendation regarding outreach efforts and notification vehicles is not intended to be exhaustive. The Task Force encourages the City to explore additional outreach and notification methods in collaboration with diverse community stakeholders. Best practices support these recommended approaches in Commission recruitment.<sup>19</sup>

### BC-2: DATA

Commission applications request demographic information (e.g., race, gender, age, income level, etc.) as well as include DEI focused questions.

Several Task Force recommendations are focused on soliciting additional demographic data from Commission applications, based on the assumption that comprehensive demographic data helps identify representation gaps, barriers to participation and access, and inequities with respect to othering and belonging. One purpose for requesting additional demographic information is to determine if there are disparities based on race, age, income, education, etc.

### BC-3: POLICY

The Mayor utilize a DEI weighted scoring system when evaluating Commission applications (e.g., demographics, underserved communities, etc.) to ensure an inclusive and equitable selection process.

In addition to gathering demographic data, the Task Force recommends that the Mayor analyze commission applications through a DEI lens to uncover potential bias. The Task Force suggests that the Mayor consider a DEI scoring/weighting system to better inform selection of commissioners, and that the Mayor consider utilizing an independent DEI Commission to perform the DEI scoring prior to her final selections.

### BC-4: POLICY

City Council expand membership on all commissions to no less than seven members to allow for more opportunities for residents to serve on commissions.

The Task Force encourages the City Council to expand commissions to no less than seven members to develop more diversity of representation and thought and encourage a broader reflection of the City's diversity.

<sup>19</sup> <https://mrsc.org/Home/Stay-Informed/MRSC-Insight/July-2013/Successful-Tips-for-Recruiting-Board-and-Commissio.aspx>





### BC-5: PROCESS

The City Manager review and evaluate the procedures and processes for collection and retention of information regarding commission applicants, as well as Inside Dublin graduates, and determine if the processes and procedures need to be amended to ensure that opportunities to serve on Commissions are being shared with Commission applicants and Inside Dublin graduates.

The Task Force believes that current and former commissioners, as well as unsuccessful commission applicants, are a fertile source for future participation and service. The Task Force recommends that the City create a database of all those who apply for commissions and that regular updates, notices, commission opportunities and other relevant communications be shared with the commissioner pool.

### BC-6: POLICY

The City Manager create a formal certification and mentor program that prepares Dublin residents to serve on Commissions.

The recommended certification and mentor programs are intended to create “fast track” opportunities for certified and mentored residents to serve on commissions. The goal is to have candidates that are ready to serve upon appointment.

The certification program could include satisfactory completion of the Inside Dublin course and similar training.

The mentor program would be structured to be voluntary and would pair residents interested in serving on commissions with current and/or former commissioner(s) to share their experiences, educate mentees, and respond to questions.

The certification and mentor programs are designed to create continuity of service, ensure that future commission members stay engaged and are prepared if they are selected to serve. The Task Force recommends that the City focus recruitment efforts on former applicants and residents from underserved and underrepresented communities to participate in the mentor program.

The Task Force recommends hybrid certification and mentor meetings that allow both in-person and virtual options to participate, and thereby make access more equitable for residents.

### BC-7: POLICY

City Council limit the duration of a term that a commissioner can serve on a Commission to a period of four years. This term limit policy to include the following:

- Commissioners would not be allowed to serve successive terms on the same Commission but could reapply for non-successive terms.
- Commissioners would be allowed to apply to be placed on another commission once their term ends.



The Task Force recommends that commissioners and other similar civic service positions not be allowed to serve successive terms on the same Commission but will have the opportunity to reapply for non-successive terms. The Task Force also recommends that commissioners have the opportunity to apply to be placed on another commission once their term ends. This term limit policy allows for more equity by providing an opportunity for more residents to be placed on commissions.

### Inclusive, Equitable and Accessible Programming and Events

#### IP-1: EVENTS

The City of Dublin host monthly Town Hall meetings designed to amplify the voices and concerns of diverse groups represented in the City of Dublin.

With respect to uplifting the voices of diverse groups, the Task Force provides the following examples of diverse groups: LGBT+ community, Black Community, Latino Community, 1st gen immigrants/ESL residents, Muslim Community, Asian Americans, residents with disabilities, etc. The City should consider aligning Town Hall meetings with cultural heritage months.

The Task Force recommends hybrid meetings with both in person and virtual options to attend, and thereby make access to town hall meetings more equitable for residents. The meetings should be held at various locations based on what best serves the needs of the targeted group participants.

The City should also provide accommodations for English as a second language residents at these events to include: providing translated questions ahead of time for 1st gen/ESL residents, recording meeting in foreign language so residents can talk freely, translating recordings with subtitles, providing translators at the meeting, and include comprehensive Zoom registration to include an option to select preferred language.

The multicultural town hall meetings will allow for more targeted outreach that will promote increased citizen participation in local affairs. Information from the meetings will also provide the City Council with a more informed sense of constituents' concerns. Cities, such as San Marino, have adopted similar monthly town hall meetings, but the Task Force believes that it is important to further pivot such gatherings to raise the thoughts and concerns of Dublin's diverse constituents.<sup>20</sup>

---

**Diversity - We will support a wide range of programs and events that reflect and cater to the diversity of our residents.<sup>21</sup>**

---

#### IP-2: DATA

The City collect data on artists and artistic diversity represented in Dublin and include the data in the annual report.

<sup>20</sup> [https://www.cityofsanmarino.org/government/departments/city\\_manager\\_s\\_office/town\\_halls\\_and\\_community\\_meetings.php](https://www.cityofsanmarino.org/government/departments/city_manager_s_office/town_halls_and_community_meetings.php)

<sup>21</sup> See Appendix A (pg. 34) to view the City of Dublin's Mission and Vision statements

## 7. FINAL RECOMMENDATION—CITYWIDE DEI INITIATIVES (CONT'D)



The Task Force believes that collecting and including data on artists in Dublin’s annual report is an opportunity to monitor and showcase the City’s artistic diversity.

### IP-3: POLICY

The City of Dublin translate local government and City information into multiple languages and post paper copies to be displayed at strategic locations and commonly used spaces and venues identified by the City.

The Task Force recommends that City-managed bulletin boxes, as well as other commonly used public spaces, be used to display translated bulletins and other resources. The Task Force suggests specifically that bulletins be built as standalone outdoor structures with a lockable display case, maintained and accessed solely by City staff. The City should ensure that bulletins are translated into the predominant languages spoken in the community of the box location (i.e., Mandarin, Chinese, Tagalog, Hindi, Farsi, Korean, Spanish, etc.). The Task Force offers the following possible box locations:

#### BOX LOCATIONS

Ulferts Center	Local Parks	Ranch 99
Dublin High School	Senior Centers	Churches/Mosques/Temples
Sahara Market	Emerald High	Dublin Library
Sodam		

### IP-4: EVENTS

The Splatter festival be renamed and rebranded to reflect a multicultural festival that highlights the diverse cultures represented in Dublin through entertainment, food, and interactive activities.

With respect to the rebranding of the Splatter festival, the Task Force offers the following guidance:

Be mindful of the date of the festival (i.e., conflicting dates with national/local holidays)	Give everyone an opportunity to showcase diversity
Explore subsidies for booth fees for local businesses and school clubs	Work with DHS cultural clubs and other Dublin schools
Conduct art contest to represent theme each year	Conduct public contest to decide name and logo for Splatter Festival
Celebrate residents with disabilities, work with Best Buddies club	Celebrate LGBTQ+ community, work with GSA club at DHS
Have interactive teaching events	Have poetry/picture book readings

## 7. FINAL RECOMMENDATION—CITYWIDE DEI INITIATIVES (CONT'D)



The Task Force recommends that the City send post-event surveys that ask about inclusion and accessibility to the event. Post-event survey sample questions could include:

- a. Did the event include a diversity of thought?
- b. Were the event speakers/moderators diverse and representative of different thoughts/perspectives?
- c. Did the event expand your capacity to think about diversity, equity, and inclusion-related topics?
- d. Were your accessibility needs met during the event?

### IP-5: EVENTS

The City of Dublin to promote local restaurants and small businesses that are owned and operated by under-represented groups through new and existing local events.

The Task Force recommends supporting and promoting minority-owned businesses and restaurants at Farmers Markets and other food events. The Task Force offers the following guidance for such events:

Feature local restaurants	Donate a portion of funds from sales to food bank
Food focused (i.e., no alcohol)	“Taste of Small Business” food vendors
Lower booth fees for Dublin businesses	Highlight a different culture, business, or restaurant monthly

### IP-6: ART

The City of Dublin displays public art that represents the City’s diversity and utilizes the public art fund in an equitable manner that encourages creation of art that represents diverse perspectives.

The Task Force recommends that the City utilize public art to further a sense of belonging within the Dublin community. The Task Force recommends that a diversity of cultures, abilities, gender diversity, mediums, styles, and artistic theories be reflected in the art forms. The Task Force offers the following guidance:

Highlight a Dublin resident in an article or social media post (à la Humans of New York style)	Approve public art and murals through a DEI lens
--	--

**Innovation - We will continue to innovate in every aspect of government and promote innovation within the business community.<sup>22</sup>**

<sup>22</sup> See Appendix A (pg. 34) to view the City of Dublin’s Mission and Vision statements



### IP-7: PROGRAMMING

The City of Dublin proactively recruit instructors and intentionally seek class offerings that represent the diverse cultures and ethnicities in Dublin.

The Task Force agrees that citywide programming for residents, from the hiring of instructors and to the approval of course materials and themes, should reflect the diversity of the constituents Dublin serves and are in alignment with the City's Mission of advancing equity and inclusion for all.

### IP-8: PROGRAMMING

The City of Dublin enhance efforts to inform Dublin residents how to submit requests for additional classes that are reflective of the City's diversity.

As part of the Task Force's recommendation to proactively recruit instructors and intentionally seek class offerings that represent the diversity of Dublin, the Task Force recommends that the City enhance efforts to inform Dublin residents how to submit requests for new class offerings.

The Task Force suggests that the City research best practices employed by other cities and agencies to revise recruitment processes, enhance the diversity of instructors and classes, and look for activities that are authentic to traditional cultures practiced and celebrated by Dublin residents (i.e. Punjabi Pakhi hand fans, Indigenous beading, etc.).

### IP-9: LIBRARY

The City of Dublin collaborate with the Alameda County Public Library to increase the selection of books by authors and illustrators who represent the diversity of Dublin (i.e. language, culture, ability, gender, etc.).

The Task Force believes that the Dublin Public Library is an appropriate forum to highlight and promote a diverse selection of authors and speakers.

## Community Agency Funding and Support

### CF-1: DATA

The City of Dublin collect demographic and experiential data to identify barriers and challenges to help inform development of an equitable Human Services Grant application and funding process.



The Task Force recommends that the City increase data collection using surveys to help inform a more equitable Human Services grant application and funding process. The surveys are intended to uplift experiential differences, identify opportunities for change and revision, and give applicants a forum to express their feedback on the process. The surveys can be administered via a question on the grant application, separate email, or short online survey. It is recommended that surveys be conducted after the application workshop and after the grant application process. Sample survey questions may include:

- How many hours were required to complete the application?
- What suggestions do you have for improving the application process?
- What is your opinion regarding the amount of data requested?
- What is your opinion of the assistance you received from City staff?
- Were instructions clear and helpful?
- Was the application workshop helpful?
- How did you find out about the grant?

Furthermore, the Task Force recommends that the City allocate additional resources, such as conducting focus groups and implementing pilot solutions, to help determine barriers to the grant process and to assist applicants with improving their success with receiving grants.

### CF-2: APPLICATION

The City of Dublin amend the Human Services Grant application to gather more demographic data and include DEI considerations.

The Task Force offers the following suggested edits to the current grant application from a DEI perspective<sup>23</sup>:

- a. Request demographics of organization’s beneficiaries, board members, and staff members
- b. Clarity on Information regarding who the organization serves
- c. #7 - Add a request for staff demographics, and number of staff within each job level (Entry-level, Intermediate, Mid-level, Senior or Executive level).
- d. #8 - Remove word limit for summary of project
- e. # 18 - Inquire how agency is working to ensure hard to reach clients are aware of their services
- f. Ask targeted DEI questions in the application:
  - i. For applicant organizations that have staff with limited English proficiency, consider providing language and cultural translation technical assistance with their grant applications. Additionally, resource permitting, consider having at least one grant reviewer who is familiar with that language and/or culture.

<sup>23</sup> The Task Force refers to the following grant application questions for their recommendation: <https://dublin.ca.gov/DocumentCenter/View/28045/Example-Grant-Application>



- ii. Give smaller organizations additional time to submit their applications (e.g., two additional weeks.)
- iii. Offer to review drafts of grant applications from smaller organizations to provide feedback before the submission deadline.
- iv. Inquire about organization's DEI lens and training
- v. Ask about cultural competency of staff, where appropriate.

### CF-3: PROCESS

The City Manager ensure equitable procedures and practices in the selection of grantees and the allocation of funding.

The Task Force provides the following recommended edits to the policies and procedures in the selection of grantees:

- a. Apply a DEI lens to each component of the grant process<sup>24</sup>
- b. As the City evaluates decisions about grants to award, review grant portfolio and identify where there might be “gaps” in terms of diversity.
  - i. For example, the Task Force suggests creating a dashboard of charts with different characteristics of the current grantee portfolio and keep the portfolio composition in mind as the City makes decisions.
  - ii. Portfolio characteristics could include percent of grantees by race/ethnic group, by age, by traumas experienced, by type of intervention, by geography, by income level, by sexual orientation, by gender, etc. The Task Force recommends not over-relying on a scorecard.
- c. Be aware about how City's due diligence process may be biased towards well-resourced organizations with greater capacity (e.g., financial stability, greater evaluation capability, etc.). Consider allocating a certain amount of funding to smaller organizations and avoid reviewing their applications against larger, more resourced organizations.
- d. Give honest feedback to organizations on their applications, out of deference for the time they invested in applying. This will help build their grant-writing capacity for future grant applications.
- e. Provide stipends to applicants who do not receive grants to compensate them for the time they spent on the application process (e.g., \$1,000 for a 10-hour process).
- f. Ask applicants how many hours they spent on the application.
- g. Provide funding for applicants to work with their communities in a deeper way to develop community-driven project proposals.
- h. Consider waiving the following requirement in the application if the program helps an underserved group in Dublin: “The organization charges a fee and/or produces other income that may be used to support this program”
- i. Have Human Services staff conduct a post-grant application workshop survey of attendees to determine intent/interest of grant applicants to apply for future grant opportunities and to understand if the application process detours applicants.

<sup>24</sup> Sample checklist for incorporating DEI in grant-making process: <https://www.ncfp.org/wp-content/uploads/2018/09/Incorporating-Diversity-Equity-and-Inclusion-in-your-Grantmaking-Process-A-Checklist-of-Potential-Actions-Arabella-Advisors-2016-a-checklist-of-potential-actions-incorporating-dei-into-your-grantmaking-process-arabella-advisors-1.pdf>



### Communications

#### CO-1: COMMUNICATIONS

The City Manager establish regular touchpoints and communications with a diverse group of community leaders and local organizations.

The Task Force believes it is imperative that the City provide community leaders and local organizations the platform to discuss pertinent issues and topics that are meaningful to Dublin residents.

#### CO-2: COMMUNICATIONS

The City of Dublin establish additional channels for two-way communication with all City residents.

To establish two-way communication channels, the Task Force recommends that the City further collaboration with community organizations and leaders to enhance outreach efforts for all Dublin residents by identifying additional channels of communication, collecting information for persons who register and respond to City webinars, trainings, conferences, and workshops, and regularly gathering demographic and contact details.

#### CO-3: SOCIAL MEDIA

The City Manager review social media policies and initiate social media campaigns to boost followers of the City's official social media accounts, as well as establish criteria and policies for posting content with a DEI lens.

The Task Force encourages the City Manager to request an audit of Dublin's social media policies and identify opportunities for growth and improvement. Furthermore, the City Manager should equip the social media team with the appropriate resources, training, and guidelines to ensure that the published posts on Dublin's accounts reflect the diversity of its residents.

#### CO-4: SOCIAL MEDIA

The City engage with the Dublin community to revise the City calendar to include:

- Lunar New Year: Change wording from “Chinese”.
- Remove Cinco De Mayo, and/or use the opportunity to inform about its true history and discourage stereotyping.





- Explore adding another holiday that is meaningful to Dublin Latino/a community, e.g., Latin American Independence September 15-16
- Larry Itliong Day, October 25

The Task Force believes that the City should recognize additional holidays on their social media accounts that are meaningful to the wide array of Dublin residents. The Task Force recommends the City engage with Dublin residents to discuss ways to update and revise the City’s Guidelines for Recognizing Culturally Significant Events to acknowledge the diverse cultural practices and traditions of the Dublin community.

### Other

#### 0-1: DATA

The City of Dublin collect the following data sets: disaggregated data on specific languages spoken at home, and disaggregated ancestry data on Asian Americans in Dublin.

The Task Force understands that the collection of disaggregated data is important because most of the Dublin population that does not speak English well are Asian Americans. The category “Asian” comprises many different languages and ethnicities. Without disaggregated data on languages spoken, the City is unable to provide multilingual resources that are best suited for the targeted community.

The evidence that supports this recommendation is<sup>25</sup>:

- 15.5% of Dublin population (or 8,766 people) speak English less than very well
- 65% of those that speak English less than very well are Asian Americans (5,660 people out of 8,766)
- Of the 39% of Dublin residents that are foreign born, 82.4% are Asian
- Foreign born population: 23,865 (51.1% citizens, 48.9% non-US citizen, or 11,676 people)
- Total Dublin population: 61,240

#### 0-2: TRAINING

The City provide ongoing DEI training for all City staff. This should include training specific to work roles (e.g., Communications Manager and Communications Analyst).

<sup>25</sup> [https://data.census.gov/cedsci/table?g=0400000US06\\_1600000US0620018&tid=ACSDP5Y2019.DP02&hidePreview=true](https://data.census.gov/cedsci/table?g=0400000US06_1600000US0620018&tid=ACSDP5Y2019.DP02&hidePreview=true)



To ensure that practices of inclusion and belonging are maintained throughout Dublin, the Task Force recommends the City to provide ongoing DEI training for all staff.

### 0-3: DEI

The City Manager embed DEI into the work and culture of the City, to include development of a Dublin City DEI process and decision-making checklist.

The Task Force encourages the City Manager to develop a checklist to ensure that practices and procedures that foster DEI are maintained throughout the City's operations.<sup>26</sup>

### 0-4: TRANSPARENCY

The City ensure greater transparency regarding grants for which the City applies to allow for community input and comment.

The Task Force views Dublin residents and community members as important voices to be included in the City's grant application process. This encourages greater transparency and provides residents platforms to raise comments on how potential grant opportunities may or may not create greater inequities in the City.

### 0-5: OVERSIGHT

The City create a Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion (DEI) Commission to monitor implementation of Task Force recommendations, uplift best practices in DEI, and hold public hearings and receive public comments on equity and belonging in Dublin.

The Task Force strongly recommends that the City consider developing a permanent DEI commission to not only oversee and implement the aforementioned recommendations, but to also provide Dublin with the appropriate governance and structure to continue advancing equity and belonging and ensure that “underrepresented communities have the access and power to make their voices heard and their needs and priorities known.”<sup>27</sup> The Task Force recommends case studies of other DEI commissions, such as one based out of Lynnwood, Washington, for the City's consideration for replication in Dublin.<sup>28</sup>

<sup>26</sup> Although this resource is an event planning checklist, it provides a sample outlining of how to incorporate DEI on a procedural level: [https://www8.gsb.columbia.edu/sites/default/files/files/Dean\\_DEI%20Checklist\\_FY21.pdf](https://www8.gsb.columbia.edu/sites/default/files/files/Dean_DEI%20Checklist_FY21.pdf)

<sup>27</sup> [https://bend.granicus.com/MapView.php?view\\_id=9&event\\_id=487&meta\\_id=41298](https://bend.granicus.com/MapView.php?view_id=9&event_id=487&meta_id=41298), pg. 16

<sup>28</sup> <https://www.lynnwoodwa.gov/Government/Boards-and-Commissions/Diversity-Equity-Inclusion-Commission>

## 8. CONCLUSION



The experience of serving on the Task Force reaffirmed the members' belief in the value of community engagement, the process of consensus building and the significance of bridging. It is important to note that the above recommendations and corresponding detail were achieved through respectful dialogue, rigorous research and investigation, a commitment to the process, and in an environment of trust, consensus building and bridging of diverse opinions and perspectives.

The Task Force understands that implementing police reform, collecting and analyzing data, and incorporating diversity, equity and inclusion in City policies, procedures and structures is not an overnight proposition, and requires the commitment and collaboration of the City Council, City staff, DPS and the community at large. The Task Force urges the City Council to give the recommendations a home, allocate appropriate resources, monitor progress, and ensure accountability.

The Task Force appreciates the opportunity to serve and stands ready to assist the City with advancing reforms necessary to create a City where everyone belongs.<sup>29</sup>



<sup>29</sup> The City of Dublin's Community Task Force web page includes various resources the Task Force has reviewed, discussed, and accumulated over the course of this engagement: <https://dublin.ca.gov/2226/Community-Task-Force-on-Equity-Diversity>



## Appendix A: City of Dublin Mission & Vision Statement

### Ensuring the Prosperity & Well-Being of Our Community<sup>30</sup>

The City Council adopted Dublin's Mission and Vision statements as part of the City's Strategic Plan. These statements are intended to serve as guidance for the City Council and commissions in their deliberations on various proposals presented to them, and to ensure that our developing community remains happy, healthy, and well-balanced. These statements were updated and modified in August 2020.

#### Our Mission

The City of Dublin promotes and supports a high quality of life, ensures a safe and secure environment, fosters new opportunities, provides equity across all programs, and champions a culture of diversity and inclusion.

#### Our Vision

Dublin is a great community to live, work, and raise a family. Dublin values:

- **Safety** - We are dedicated to excellent public safety resources, including police and fire.
- **Finances** - We will strive to be fiscally transparent and balance our budgets annually.
- **Inclusivity** - We will advocate for programs and policies that support inclusive access to housing and cultural opportunities.
- **Diversity** - We will support a wide range of programs and events that reflect and cater to the diversity of our residents.
- **Equity** - We will deliver our services in a way that ensures equitable access to all.
- **Innovation** - We will continue to innovate in every aspect of government and promote innovation within the business community.
- **Customer Service** - We will provide welcoming, excellent customer services to our residents and businesses at all times.
- **Living an Active Lifestyle** - We will continuously promote an active lifestyle through our parks and facilities and encourage participation in local sports.
- **History** - We will honor our history through places and programs that remind people of our beginnings.
- **Business** - We will provide a full spectrum of opportunity by supporting current and prospective businesses through ongoing economic development efforts and helping them grow and thrive locally.
- **Environmental Sustainability** - We will continue to lead in building a well-planned sustainable community and protecting our natural resources.

<sup>30</sup> <https://dublin.ca.gov/72/Mission-Vision>