

5.12 PUBLIC SERVICES

INTRODUCTION

This section describes the Project's effect on public services. The following resources were used to prepare this section:

- City of Dublin General Plan (2016)
- Eastern Dublin Specific Plan (2016)
- Alameda County General Plan, East County Area Plan (2002)
- City of Livermore General Plan (2014)
- *Community Impact Assessment (CIA)* prepared for the Project¹

These documents are available on file with the City of Dublin at 100 Civic Plaza, Dublin, California.

Scoping Issues Addressed

No public or agency comments related to public services were received during the public scoping period for this Draft environmental impact report (EIR).

REGULATORY SETTING

Federal

There are no applicable federal regulations.

State

Police Services

All law enforcement agencies within California are organized and operate in accordance with the applicable provisions of the California Penal Code. This code sets forth the authority, rules of conduct, and training for police officers.

Fire Protection

California Occupational Safety and Health Administration

In accordance with the California Code of Regulations, Title 8, Sections 1270 (Fire Prevention) and 6773 (Fire Protection and Fire Equipment), the California Occupational Safety and Health Administration has established minimum standards for fire suppression and emergency medical

¹ A Community Impact Assessment (CIA) evaluates land use, growth, and community character, traffic and transportation/pedestrian and bicycle facilities, and public involvement that may result from the implementation of the project.

services. The standards include, but are not limited to, guidelines on the handling of highly combustible materials, fire hose sizing requirements, restrictions on the use of compressed air, access roads, and the testing, maintenance, and use of all fire-fighting and emergency medical equipment.

California Fire Code

The California Fire Code contains regulations relating to construction and maintenance of buildings and the use of premises. Fire hazards are addressed mainly through the application of the State Fire Code that addresses access, including roads, and vegetation removal in high fire hazard areas, fire hydrants, automatic sprinkler systems, fire alarm systems, fire and explosion hazards safety, and many other general and specialized fire safety requirements.

California Health and Safety Code

State fire regulations are set forth in Sections 13000 et seq. of the California Health and Safety Code. This includes regulations for building standards (as also set forth in the California Building Code), fire protection and notification systems, fire protection devices such as extinguishers and smoke alarms, high-rise building and childcare facility standards, and fire suppression training.

Emergency Response

The state passed legislation authorizing the Office of Emergency Services to prepare a Standard Emergency Management System program, which sets forth measures by which a jurisdiction should handle emergency disasters. Non-compliance with the State Emergency Management Systems could result in the State withholding disaster relief from the non-complying jurisdiction in the event of an emergency disaster.

Local

City of Dublin

City of Dublin General Plan

Dublin’s General Plan establishes the following guiding and implementing policies associated with public services that are relevant to the Project:

- | | |
|---------------------------------|--|
| Implementing Policy 2.6.4.B.2.a | Utilities and public safety services will be provided at urban standards without financial burden to Dublin residents and businesses outside the Eastern Extended Planning Area. |
| Guiding Policy 4.2.1.A.2 | Cooperate with the Dublin Unified School District to ensure provision of school facilities in the Extended Planning Areas. |

Eastern Dublin Specific Plan

Dublin’s Eastern Dublin Specific Plan (EDSP) contains the following goal and policies related to public services, utilities and service systems, which are relevant to the Project:

Goal: To ensure that fire protection services in eastern Dublin are consistent with standards maintained in the rest of the city.

Policy 8-5: Time the construction of new facilities to coincide with new service demand in order to avoid periods of reduced service efficiency. The first station will be sited and construction completed prior to completion of initial development in the planning area.

Goal: Provide adequate police services to the eastern Dublin planning area to ensure the health, safety and welfare of existing and future residents, workers, and visitors.

Policy 8-4: Provide additional personnel and facilities and revise “beats” as needed in order to establish and maintain City standards for police protection service in eastern Dublin.

Program 8E: Incorporate into the requirements of project approval Police Department recommendations on project design that affects traffic safety and crime prevention.

Goal: To provide a full complement of community services and facilities as needed in eastern Dublin.

Alameda County

Alameda County General Plan, East County Area Plan

The main goal of the East County Area Plan is to ensure the prompt and efficient provision of police, fire, and emergency medical facility and service needs. Relevant policies include:

Policy 241: The County shall provide effective law enforcement, fire, and emergency medical services to unincorporated areas.

Alameda County Emergency Operations Plan

The purpose of the County’s Emergency Operations Plan is to establish policies and procedures and assign responsibilities to effective management of emergency operations within the County.

The County’s response to disasters is based on five phases:

1. Prevention
2. Preparedness
3. Response
4. Recovery
5. Mitigation

During each phase, there are specified activities, operational capabilities, and effective responses to a given disaster. The Alameda County Emergency Management Program complies with federal guidance to use the National Incident Management System and state guidance to use the Standardized Emergency Management System. The National Incident Management System provides a comprehensive approach to emergency management for all hazards and creates a consistent approach to domestic emergency management at all jurisdictional levels. The Standardized Emergency Management System is used to manage multi-agency and multi-jurisdictional responses to emergencies in California. The Standardized Emergency Management System consists of five hierarchical levels: Field, Local Government, Operational Area, Regional, and State. The Local Government level for Alameda County consists of the 14 incorporated cities, the County, and special districts. Local governments manage and coordinate the overall emergency response and recovery activities within their jurisdiction.

Livermore

City of Livermore General Plan

Livermore's General Plan, Infrastructure Element provides information and policy guidance related to community infrastructure including police services, fire services, and schools. The following goals, policies, and objectives are relevant to the Project:

- | | |
|--------------------|---|
| Goal INF-5 | Maintain a safe environment in Livermore through enforcement of the law, prevention of crime and the function of partnerships with the community. |
| Policy INF-5.1-P2. | The City shall request notification from the County of development projects within the unincorporated part of the Planning Area that could call for law enforcement services from the City. |
| Objective INF-5.2 | Maintain and improve law enforcement and crime prevention services to keep pace with Livermore's changing population. |
| Objective INF-6.2 | Promote coordination between land use planning and fire protection. |
| Policy INF-6.2-P2. | The City shall request notification from the County of development projects within the unincorporated part of the Planning Area that could call for fire protection services from the City. |

EXISTING CONDITIONS

This section presents information on public services in the study area. The discussion is divided by the type of public service, and further organized by jurisdiction. The public services study area includes the Project site, as well as the entire service district for each public service provider.

Police Services

City of Dublin

The Alameda County Sheriff's Office provides law enforcement to the City of Dublin on a contract basis, known locally as Dublin Police Services. Dublin Police Services have 60 sworn officers and four Sheriff's technicians assigned to the duty station at Dublin Civic Center. Four Dublin civilian employees provide additional support services for Dublin Police Services. The average response time to an emergency call from the time of dispatch to a life-or-death emergency averages 3.5 minutes. The Dublin Police Services responded to 38,551 calls for service in 2018 with an average response time to priority calls in 3.5 minutes. This response time meets the Alameda County Sheriff's Office standards and the industry average of five minutes.²

Alameda County

The Alameda County Sheriff's Office, in addition to providing police services to Dublin, provides patrol and investigation services to unincorporated areas of the County. The Alameda County Sheriff's Office serves out of locations throughout the County. Criminal investigations, crime prevention, and some business office functions are performed at Dublin Civic Center (100 Civic Center), while dispatch and some data processing functions are handled at Sheriff's Office facilities in Oakland and San Leandro. The Sheriff's Office has over 1,500 authorized positions, including in excess of 1,000 sworn personnel. In addition to the Sheriff's Office, the California Highway Patrol has jurisdiction over public roadways in unincorporated areas of the County.

City of Livermore

The Livermore Police Department (LPD) has 90 officers and 45 full-time personnel. LPD headquarters is located at 1110 South Livermore Avenue, approximately 8 miles southeast of the study area. The average response time to an emergency call is about 4.5 minutes.³

Fire Protection and Emergency Response Services

State of California

The California Department of Forestry and Fire Protection (CAL FIRE) is responsible for fire protection and stewardship of over 31 million acres of California's privately-owned wildlands. The CAL FIRE Air Program has aircrafts strategically placed throughout California in order to provide aerial firefighting services. CAL FIRE's groundborne services include an array of fire protection and prevention programs, including general firefighting equipment, wildlife engineering programs, and vegetation management programs.

² Alameda County Sheriff's Office. Emergency Services Dispatch. Available: https://www.alamedacountysheriff.org/les_dispatch.php. Accessed: December 4, 2018.

³ City of Livermore. Livermore Police Department. Available: <http://www.cityoflivermore.net/citygov/police/>. Accessed: December 5, 2018.

State Responsibility Areas (SRAs) are areas where the state has primary financial responsibility for prevention and suppression of wildfires. The portion of the Project site in unincorporated County land is a SRA.⁴ The nearest CAL FIRE station to the Project site is Sunol Fire Station 14, located approximately 8 miles southwest of the Project site. The SRA Fire Prevention Fee is a fee applied to all habitable structures within a given SRA and serves to fund a variety of important fire prevention services in the SRA. Such activities include fuel reduction activities that lessen risk of wildfire to communities and evacuation routes. Other activities include fire prevention engineering, emergency evacuation planning, fire prevention education, fire hazard severity mapping, implementation of state and local Fire Plans and fire-related law enforcement activities such as arson investigation. CAL FIRE may support or supplement local fire response efforts.

City of Dublin

Fire protection services within Dublin are provided by the Dublin Fire Prevention Bureau (DFPB), under The Alameda County Fire Department (ACFD). The ACFD provides Dublin with 36 personnel and operates 3 firehouses.⁵ Fire Station 18 is the closest fire station to the Project site, located at 4800 Fallon Road, about .25 miles northwest of the western terminus of the Project site.

Alameda County

The ACFD would provide fire protection to the Project site in unincorporated areas of the County. The ACFD serves approximately 508 square miles and operates 29 fire stations and 35 companies serving a population of 394,000.⁶ ACFD serves densely populated urban areas, waterways, industrialized centers, extensive urban interface, agricultural and wildland regions. With over 400 personnel and 100 Reserve Firefighters, ACFD provides a wide variety of services, including three specialized response teams: Hazardous Materials Unit, Urban Search and Rescue Unit, and Water Rescue Team Unit.

The ACFD has mutual aid agreements with the Livermore-Pleasanton Fire Department (LPPFD), the San Ramon Valley Fire Department, and the Camp Parks Fire Department.⁷ These agreements help to ensure service is sent based on shortest response times and may result in a mix of different agencies responding to a particular call. In the case of a wildland fire within the SRA of the County, CAL FIRE's ground and air resources are available to provide support and fire suppression.

The Alameda County Emergency Operations Plan identifies Emergency Operation Centers (EOCs) responsible for providing extended emergency response operations across the County. Extended emergency operations involve the coordination and management of personnel and resources to mitigate an emergency and facilitate the transition to recovery operations. Alameda County's

⁴ CAL FIRE, 2018. Available: <http://www.fire.ca.gov/>. Accessed: December 4, 2018.

⁵ Alameda County, 2018. Alameda County Fire Department, Fire Stations/Facilities. Available: <https://www.acgov.org/fire/about/statistics.htm>. Accessed: December 4, 2018.

⁶ Alameda County, 2018. Alameda County Fire Department, About Us. Available: <https://www.acgov.org/fire/about/statistics.htm>. Accessed: December 4, 2018.

⁷ Alameda County, 2013. *Alameda County General Plan, Safety Element*. Amended 2014. Available: <https://www.acgov.org/cda/planning/generalplans/documents/SafetyElementAmendmentFinal.pdf>. Accessed: December 4, 2018.

Primary EOC is in Dublin at 4985 Broder Boulevard, approximately 1 mile northwest of the western terminus of the Project site. The EOC is equipped with emergency power generators, radios, telephones, maps, and is staffed 24-hours per day.⁸

City of Livermore

The LPFD is the fire, emergency response, and community service organization serving Livermore. The LPFD operates 10 fire stations, 8 engines, and has 121 employees. The average fire response time is just over 6 minutes as of 2017. The closest fire station to the Project site is Station 10, approximately 4 miles east at 330 Airway Boulevard.⁹

Schools

City of Dublin

The Alameda County Office of Education oversees Dublin Unified School District (DUSD). According to DUSD, over 11,500 students from preschool through adult education attend Dublin's schools. Dublin offers 8 elementary schools, 2 middle schools, 1 high school, and 1 alternative high school. The closest DUSD schools to the Project are Cottonwood Creek Elementary School about .25 miles north, Amador Elementary School about 4 miles north, and Fallon Middle school about 5 miles northwest.

Alameda County

The Alameda County Office of Education oversees 18 Unified School Districts within the County. This agency has oversight responsibilities for district budgets and educational plans, and serves as a district providing school programs for the County's most vulnerable students.

City of Livermore

The Livermore Valley Joint Unified School District (LVJUSD), overseen by the Alameda County Office of Education, serves more than 13,900 of Livermore's students in transitional kindergarten through 12th grade at 11 elementary campuses, 5 middle schools, 2 comprehensive high schools, and 2 alternative schools. LVJUSD also serves the unincorporated County land between Dublin and Livermore. The closest LVJUSD schools to the Project site are Rancho Las Positas Elementary School about 5 miles southeast and Marilyn Avenue Elementary School about 6 miles southeast of the Project site.

⁸ Alameda County Sheriff's Office of Homeland Security and Emergency Services. 2012. *Alameda County Emergency Operations Plan*. Available: <https://www.acgov.org/ready/documents/EmergencyOperationsPlan.pdf>. Accessed: December 3, 2018.

⁹ Livermore-Pleasanton Fire Department. Available: <http://www.cityoflivermore.net/citygov/fire/about/default.htm>. Accessed: December 5, 2018.

Community Facilities

City of Dublin

Dublin provides a variety of community facilities, including:

- The Dublin Public Library
- The Dublin Senior Center
- The Civic Center
- Shannon Community Center
- Heritage Park and Museums
- Emerald Glen Park
- “The Wave” Water Park

The Dublin Senior Center is about 8 miles west of the study area, located at 7600 Amador Valley Boulevard. The Senior Center offers a variety of classes, activities, programs, and a large ballroom for events. The Dublin Civic Center is a 53,000 square-foot building about 7 miles west of the Project site and is home to Dublin’s administrative offices and Dublin Police Services. The Shannon Community Center is a 19,700 square-foot building that provides a banquet hall for 300 people, a teaching kitchen, two preschool classroom, and meeting spaces. The Center is located about 9 miles northwest from the Project. Dublin Heritage Park and Museums is a 10-acre park with historic buildings, lawns, a historic cemetery, and picnic areas. Two museums are on the site: the 1856 Murray Schoolhouse and the Kolb House. Emerald Glen Park is a 48.2-acre park located at Tassajara Road and Central Parkway. The park features the Emerald Glen Recreation and Aquatic Complex (“The Wave”), which features two pools, a waterslide tower, a Splash Zone, and a community room.

Alameda County

The Alameda County Recreation Plan is a plan for beaches, parks and recreation areas in the County. The Recreation Plan also includes policies for community facilities in the County. All community facilities in the County are under the jurisdiction of the cities they are located in. The Recreation Plan is discussed further in **Section 5.13, Recreation**.

City of Livermore

Livermore’s community facilities include the Robert Livermore Community Center (RLCC), swim centers, and sports parks. The RLCC serves as the area’s recreation destination and offers 71,000 square feet of indoor space with a community building, recreation building, and a 45,000-square-foot aquatics center. The RLCC provides activities for kids, adults, and seniors. Fairs and showcases are also held at the RLCC. The RLCC is about 5 miles southeast of the Project site.

IMPACTS AND MITIGATION MEASURES

Significance Criteria

The following significance criterion for public services was derived from the Environmental Checklist in CEQA Guidelines Appendix G. The significance criterion has been amended or supplemented, as appropriate, to address lead agency requirements and the full range of impacts of the Project.

An impact of the Project would be considered significant and would require mitigation if it would meet the following criteria:

- A. Would the project result in substantial adverse physical impacts associated with the provision of new or physically altered governmental facilities, need for new or physically altered governmental facilities, the construction of which could cause significant environmental impacts, in order to maintain acceptable service ratios, response times or other performance objectives for any of the following public services: fire protection, police protection, schools, parks, other public facilities

Methodology

To determine potential impacts, the impact significance criteria identified above were applied to construction and operation of the Project. The local and regional planning documents outlined above were used to guide the Project's impact analysis, along with independent research on relevant police, fire, and emergency services.

Impact Analysis

Physical impacts to public services are usually associated with population in-migration and growth in an area, which increase the demand for a particular service, leading to the need for expanded or new facilities.

No Impact Summary

There are no "no impact" determinations for this topic.

Impacts of the Project

- A. Would the project result in substantial adverse physical impacts associated with the provision of new or physically altered governmental facilities, need for new or physically altered governmental facilities, the construction of which could cause significant environmental impacts, in order to maintain acceptable service ratios, response times or other performance objectives for any of the following public services: Fire protection, Police protection, schools, parks, other public facilities

The Project would not include the provision of new or physically altered government facilities. There are no government facilities within the Project site or adjacent to the Project. Therefore, the Project would not result in direct physical impacts related to the construction or expansion of government facilities. The Project's potential indirect effects on the need for new or expanded government facilities and response times are described below.

As discussed in **Chapter 3.0, Project Description** and **Chapter 7.0, Other CEQA Considerations**, reasonably foreseeable indirect growth resulting from the Project is already planned for and forecasted in land use regulating documents (i.e., Dublin's General Plan, EDSP, Livermore's General Plan, and the East County Area Plan). Because the Project would not encourage growth beyond what is already planned for and forecasted, the proposed improvements would not result in an indirect increased demand for public services. Each type of public service is discussed below.

Fire Protection and Police Protection

Impact SERV-1: Project construction could temporarily result in interference with emergency services access as a result of construction work at the intersections of Dublin Boulevard/Fallon Road and Doolan Road/North Canyons Parkway. (Less than Significant with Mitigation)

Construction of the Project may require temporary detouring at the Dublin Boulevard/Fallon Road intersection and Doolan Road/North Canyons Parkway intersection, and temporary closures at the new intersection of Dublin Boulevard and Croak Road. This could result in interference with emergency vehicle access. This impact would be addressed through **Mitigation Measure TRAF-1**, as described in **Section 5.14, Transportation and Traffic**. This measure requires preparation of a traffic management plan (TMP), which would include press releases to notify and inform emergency services of upcoming road closures and detours, and coordination with emergency service providers to ensure that adequate service to the entire service area would be maintained during construction. For the above reasons, this impact would be less than significant with mitigation.

Mitigation for Impact SERV-1:

Mitigation Measure TRAF-1 (described in Section 5.14, Transportation and Traffic)

Less than Significant Impacts

Fire Protection and Police Protection

The Project would provide motorists, bicyclists, and pedestrians an alternative local route through an area of eastern Dublin and the County that is presently served by the police and fire services listed above. As discussed in **Chapter 7.0, Other CEQA Considerations**, the Project would primarily redirect existing vehicle trips. As a new roadway, the Project would introduce the opportunity for vehicle accidents, which could require police and fire services. Given that the Project would allow existing travelers to use an alternate route within existing service areas, the overall increase in demand for emergency services is reasonably anticipated to be minimal. Implementation of the Project would potentially improve access and response times for emergency

services traveling within the vicinity of the Project, as emergency vehicles would have an alternative route to use and would have improved access to eastern Dublin and the unincorporated part of the County between Dublin and Livermore.

Dublin, the County, and Livermore have taken the Project into account in planning for the future expansion or addition of police and fire facilities, as each jurisdiction's General Plan (and related EIR) includes the extension of Dublin Boulevard to the Doolan Road/North Canyons Parkway intersection in Livermore. Therefore, the Project would indirectly support implementation of Dublin's General Plan, the EDSP, the East County Area Plan, and Livermore's General Plan. The Project would not result in unplanned demand for police or fire services, or an incremental increase in demand that would reasonably be expected to necessitate new or expanded government facilities. For the above reasons, this impact would be **less than significant**.

Schools

The Project would not include any residential or major employment uses and therefore would not directly result in increased demand for schools. Dublin, the County, and Livermore have taken the Project into account in each jurisdiction's General Plan (and related EIRs). Therefore, the Project would indirectly support implementation of Dublin's General Plan, the EDSP, the East County Area Plan, and Livermore's General Plan. These documents and their related EIRs account for future demand for schools and the provision of schools. Therefore, the Project would not indirectly result in increased demand for schools or result in impacts related to new or expanded schools. For the above reasons, this impact would be **less than significant**.

Parks

The Project would not include any residential or major employment uses that would increase demand for parks in the study area, nor would the Project impact any existing parks. See **Section 5.13, Recreation**, for a detailed discussion regarding Project impacts to parks and recreation facilities. This impact would be **less than significant**.

Other Public Facilities

Open space and other public facilities such as libraries and community centers are typically provided to serve the residents of their respective jurisdictions. Given the Project has no residential component, Project implementation would not directly increase demand for open space or other public facilities. As mentioned above, the Project would indirectly support planned land uses in eastern Dublin by providing roadway access to developable areas, consistent with local and regional planning documents. The Project would not induce demand for other public facilities in unincorporated areas of the County, as the Project would not include any land use changes that would allow residential uses or promote growth in the County. The Project would improve accessibility to open space and other public facilities for existing residents of Dublin and Livermore. Based on the above, this impact would be **less than significant**.

CUMULATIVE IMPACTS

Cumulative impacts arise due to the linking of impacts from past, present, and foreseeable future projects in the region. Other projects in the area include past and planned residential, commercial, and infrastructure development projects in Dublin, Livermore, and elsewhere around the study area (see **Chapter 4.0, Introduction to Environmental Analysis**). The cumulative year for the Project is 2040, and includes the growth projections of Plan Bay Area and jurisdiction's General Plans, along with specific development projects determined to be reasonably foreseeable by each jurisdiction.

The Project would indirectly support the development of planned residential and employment uses in eastern Dublin by providing roadway access to developable areas, consistent with local and regional planning documents. Therefore, an increased demand for public services indirectly resulting from the Project has been accounted for in the EDSP, General Plan, and their respective EIRs, which include provisions to provide adequate public services at projected buildout. The Project, combined with past, present, and reasonably foreseeable future projects, would not exceed those projections, and a cumulative impact to public services would not occur. Land use development other than minor agricultural-related uses is prohibited in unincorporated areas of the County, consistent with the County's urban growth boundary. For the above reasons, a cumulative impact would not occur. The Project would not result in a cumulatively considerable contribution to a significant cumulative impact.

REFERENCES

- Alameda County, 2000. *East County Area Plan*. Available:
<https://www.acgov.org/cda/planning/generalplans/index.htm>. Accessed: November 22, 2018.
- City of Dublin, 2017. *City of Dublin General Plan*. Available:
<https://www.dublin.ca.gov/DocumentCenter/View/10560/Chapter-12>. Accessed: June 5, 2018.
- City of Dublin, 1994. *Eastern Dublin Specific Plan*, Amended 2016. Available:
<https://www.dublin.ca.gov/DocumentCenter/View/7776/EDSP-2016-Update-Full-PDF?bidId=>. Accessed: November 28, 2018.
- City of Livermore. 2004. *City of Livermore General Plan 2003-2025*. Amended December 2014.